# A COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION OF THE SOCIO-ECONOMIC SITUATION AND ACADEMIC SUCCESS OF MINORITY STUDENTS IN WEST BENGAL SINCE INDEPENDENCE

Mahasin Mondal<sup>1</sup>, Dr. Neelam Khare<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Research Scholar, Dept. of Education, Sri Satya Sai University of Technology and Medical Sciences, Sehore Bhopal-Indore Road, Madhya Pradesh, India.

<sup>2</sup> Research Guide, Dept. of Education, Sri Satya Sai University of Technology and Medical Sciences, Sehore Bhopal-Indore Road, Madhya Pradesh, India.

# Abstract

A lot of research has been done on how well students do in school. On the other hand, kids from low-income families have to deal with more problems. When kids go through hard times, it makes life harder for them as they grow up. There are many things that can affect how well a child does in school. Without schools, people can't live together. They don't have a life of their own. Some students may need a little extra push to do well, and schools should give them that push. During the Mughal and colonial times, Bengal was one of the most wealthy parts of the subcontinent. Even though the colonial government was cruel and the country was split up, West Bengal was one of the most socio-economincs status and acholastic achievement of minority students and developed states when India got its independence. But the state's performance right now is about average for Indian states. This investigation includes a fair look at all relevant facts that are available to the public and a review of the many points of view that have been put forward by scholars over the years. West Bengal's economic problems were made worse by both division and federal and state policies. Because of this, industrial and agricultural growth, urbanisation, human well-being, and the growth resources of the state were all hurt. In the last few years, West Bengal's growth has gotten better overall, including in the socio-economincs status and acholastic achievement. The state's finances have been improved, and they could be improved even more in the future. The city's infrastructure is better in Kolkata.

Keywords: Socio-Economincs Status, Acholastic Achievement, Minority Students.

# Introduction

The researcher made an effort to locate the papers that were required in the areas of intellectual growth, academic achievement, and socioeconomic standing. After searching for relevant writing, she discovered that there was no study that was comparable to the one that she was conducting. In each of the studies, the researchers used a unique combination of factors or conducted the experiments at varying levels with a variety of participants. In addition to this, the researcher did his best to investigate both international and Indian studies that were relevant to the issue at hand. These things can be classified as belonging to one of the following categories:

• Studies on the academic performance of pupils in their respective schools

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

Research has been conducted on a variety of topics, including gender, IQ, and social and economic standing.

At each stage of the research process, including coming up with a hypothesis and putting it to the test, determining how to gather data, and deciphering what it all indicates, doing a review of the relevant material is essential. The researcher can get an understanding of what is currently known about the topic by reading a variety of relevant papers, such as books, journals, dissertations, theses, and other relevant documents. This helps the researcher define and narrow the problem. Additionally, it prevents researchers from discovering the same thing twice. It simplifies the process of learning how to do research and identifies studies that could be the subject of further investigation. In this article, we will take a cursory look at some research that has been done on the topic of the issue of academic achievement. Introduction Research in education is an organised effort to learn more about the operation of educational systems, typically with the goal of making education more effective. The findings of educational research provide guidance to educators regarding the methods of instruction and other learning environments that are most effective in enabling students to acquire the knowledge and abilities they seek. Because education is a branch of the behavioural sciences, the primary purpose of educational research is to comprehend, explain, and even in some ways anticipate and exert influence over the behaviours of individuals. The importance of educational research lies in the fact that it provides us with relevant and trustworthy knowledge that can be utilised to enhance the manner in which we instruct. Because education is predicated on a corpus of knowledge, enhancing it by incorporating new scientific understanding will make it more comprehensive and superior. It is also essential to clarify and reevaluate the information that is currently common knowledge in the industry. Because of this, it will be much simpler to make adjustments to the various educational programmes. It is imperative that education have a significant role. It will be helpful in making modifications to the curricula, textbooks, teaching methods, and evaluations that are currently in place.

# **Related work**

In educational research, socioeconomic class is almost certainly the contextual variable that is examined the vast majority of the time. Researchers are paying an increasing amount of attention to the correlation between a student's household income and their academic performance at school. Since the beginning of time, there has been a correlation between a person's socioeconomic standing and their level of intellectual achievement. However, the findings of White's meta-analysis show that this link varies greatly depending on factors such as the type of SES indicator and the academic performance indicator that was employed in the studies. Following the publication of White's metaanalysis, a number of more recent empirical investigations have been carried out. While Sutton and Soderstrom both came to the conclusion that there was a significant connection between the two, other researchers came to the conclusion that there was no connection at all. The most recent findings do not correspond with one another in any way. To the best of our knowledge, there has not been a comprehensive examination of what the findings of this empirical research were (with the exception of a few narrative reviews, the vast most of which concentrate on a specific topic; for example,). This meta-analysis looks at articles that came out between and looked at the most recent studies on the link between children's development and their socioeconomic position. In order to undertake a review like this, this meta-analysis looks at the papers (SES). They came to the conclusion that older studies differed significantly in a number of significant ways from more current ones that were published. The first alteration is one that has been made by researchers to the manner in which they operate with SES. The present research is more likely to utilise a wide range of SES indicators, such as family income, the mother's degree, and a measure of family structure, rather than simply utilising the father's education and/or job as the sole indicator of socioeconomic status (SES). This is due to the fact that the research that is being discussed currently was conducted much more recently. In the entirety of the United States, there have also been shifts in the amount of knowledge had by parents

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

and the composition of their families. In particular, there has been a significant increase in the average level of education held by American parents. As a direct consequence of this, the majority of today's parents have higher levels of education than their parents did while they were growing up. In a similar manner, the percentage of children aged 15-18 who lived in households with only one sibling increased from 48 percent in 1970 to 73 percent in 1990. This was a significant increase. This was a significant decrease from 1970, when 48 percent of people were living in such homes in the United States. (Grissmer, Kirby, Berends, & Williamson, 1994). Third, researchers in this field are concentrating their efforts on identifying moderating factors that, if changed, could disrupt the significant correlation that exists between socioeconomic position and academic ability. In more recent studies, greater consideration has been given to factors such as a student's colour or ethnicity, the type of neighbourhood they live in, as well as their grade level. As a result of this, the consequences of one's socioeconomic standing can be related to a variety of various causes and effects. Because of this, it is difficult to determine whether or not there has been a shift in the association between socioeconomic position and academic achievement since the publication of White's study in 1982. This is due to the fact that societal, economic, and methodological shifts have taken place in the intervening time. These alterations have taken place since the initial evaluation was conducted. In order to investigate whether or not there was a correlation between a student's family income and how well they did in school, this study looked at research that was conducted and published between the years 1990 and 2000. Our objective is to determine the strength of the correlation between socioeconomic status (SES) and academic performance, as well as the extent to which this correlation is influenced by a variety of methodological factors (such as the type of SES or academic performance measure) and student characteristics. In addition, we want to examine the extent to which this correlation is influenced by the relationship between SES and academic performance. In addition to this, one of our goals is to determine the extent to which one's socioeconomic standing influences their level of academic achievement (such as grade level, ethnicity, and the location of the school). We also want to make an attempt to duplicate White's metaanalysis by utilising the findings of recently published research as our source data in order to determine whether or not the results are consistent.

## How to Measure Economic Status

It would appear that the conceptual meaning of socioeconomic status (SES) and the empirical assessment of SES are still not on the same page in studies involving children and adolescents. This is despite the fact that the socioeconomic status (SES) has been the focus of a significant lot of study. According to White, the socioeconomic status (SES) is measured using a wide variety of characteristics, which is one of the reasons why it is so difficult to comprehend the conclusions of research. Another reason why it is so difficult to comprehend the findings of research is because there are so many different types of research. One may make an argument very similar to this one in present times. Academics frequently swap the terms "socioeconomic status" (SES) and "social class" (social class), but they do not provide a rationale or an explanation for this common practise. According to the description of the Social & Economic Sphere, a person's or a family's position in a hierarchy is determined by their access to or control over some combination of valuable commodities, including wealth and power. This can apply to both individuals and families. The reason for this is that according to the SES, valuable commodities are defined as "access to or control over some combination of valuable goods." It would appear that there is a general consensus regarding the definition of the tripartite nature of socioeconomic status that has been proposed, which states that parental incomes, educational attainment, and occupations are the three primary indicators of socioeconomic status. [Citation needed] [Citation needed] [Citation needed] [Citation needed] [Citation needed] It has been proven that there is some evidence to infer that there are relationships between these variables; however, the most important discovery was that each component of SES is unique and ought to be considered as an independent variable from the others. [Citation needed] [Citation needed] The level of financial and social resources that are available to

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

kids is reflected in the income of their parents, which acts as an indicator of the students' families' socioeconomic position (SES). Second, the education level of one's parents is considered to be one of the most consistent aspects of one's socioeconomic status (SES) because it is typically determined at a young age and has a tendency to remain the same over the course of history. This is one of the reasons why it is considered to be one of the most reliable aspects of SES. It is possible to get an accurate forecast of the income of a household in the United States by looking at the degree of education of the parents of that household. There is a high link between the two variables. The importance of a person's occupation in determining their socioeconomic status (SES) is calculated by using data regarding education and compensation that is provided by the individual's employer. This data is used to determine the importance of a person's occupation in determining their SES (Hauser, 1994). For example, Duncan's Socioeconomic Index (1961) provides insight into the socioeconomic standing of a family by not only measuring the salary and education required for a job, but also the social standing and culture associated with a certain socioeconomic group. This gives the index the ability to provide an accurate depiction of a family's socioeconomic standing. Because of this, the index is able to present an accurate picture of the socioeconomic standing of a household. Utilization of household resources is a fairly rare event when compared to the three other major indicators. This is because household resources are typically limited in quantity. On the other hand, researchers have recently brought attention to the significance of various home resources as indicators of the socioeconomic level of families. [Citation needed] After-school and summertime are both times when there are a range of educational programmes available for students to participate in. Laptops with educational software and books that can be read at home are two examples of alternatives.

## Measures of SES as a Complete

Researchers in the field of education also have to decide if they will use a student's individual socioeconomic status or an average SES based on the school the student goes to or the neighbourhood where the student lives. The economic status of a school is often judged by how many of its students qualify for free or low-cost lunches during the school year. Free school lunches are available to students whose families' incomes are at or below 130 percent of the federal poverty line. People whose incomes are between 130 percent and 185 percent of the federal poverty threshold can get meals at a lower price. On the other hand, the economic status of a neighbourhood or county is usually judged by the number of people who are at least 20 years old and don't have a high school diploma, according to census data. Socioeconomic status (SES) indicators in schools and neighbourhoods may measure SES in different ways, but they all stick to the idea that SES is a context-based measure of social and economic well-being that goes beyond the socioeconomic resources that students may have access to at home. Using aggregated SES metrics to make sense of the results of different studies with different units of analysis can lead to a problem called "ecological fallacy." The ecological fallacy is nothing more than a simple case of misinterpretation, in which an individual-level conclusion is drawn from evidence that was collected for a group. In the context of this review, the phrase "within-school or within-neighborhood relationships" refers to the mistaken belief that study findings at the school or neighbourhood level also show relationships that exist within schools or neighbourhoods, and vice versa. It is not possible to use socioeconomic data about a school or neighbourhood as if it were information about a family's socioeconomic background. Also, it's not right to use socioeconomic data about students to explain differences between schools.

# Personalities of the Students

It is not only how well a pupil performs in school that is influenced by their socioeconomic class, but also their colour or ethnicity, grade level, school location, and other factors. Indirect or direct, these effects can have an impact. The community in which a child will be raised and educated is strongly influenced by the socioeconomic status of their family. Both direct and indirect types of "social capital," in the form of supporting interactions between structural forces and individuals, such as

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

parent-school cooperation, help people share society norms and values, which are essential for academic success. Through these connections, people can better understand and accept the expectations of others in society, which is essential for academic success. Success in school depends on a student's ability to build up this "social capital." Many student-specific variables, in addition to the methodological ones just mentioned, can impact the relationship between socioeconomic status and academic achievement. Because some of these traits have been linked to academic performance, it's probable that this is the reason.

# **Grade Level**

Depending on the grade level at which a student is enrolled, the impact of social and economic factors on academic performance can vary Previous studies, however, have provided mixed results on the manner in which grade level or age affects the link between socioeconomic position and academic achievement. and a subsequent review by White (1982) found a decreasing relationship between a student's socioeconomic status and their academic performance as they aged, while White (1982) found no such relationship. Socioeconomic position is no longer as important as it formerly was for academic attainment, according to White. When it comes to education, everyone suffers the same kinds of things. This suggests that the more time students spend in school, the less of an impact their family's socioeconomic status has on their academic success. Second, students from low-income families are more likely to drop out of school, which diminishes the correlation. Contrary to popular belief, longitudinal studies have revealed a widening of the gap between low- and highsocioeconomic status (SES) kids as they get older. They were undertaken by Duncan et al. and Walker et al. as well as Greenwood and Hart and Carta.

# **Minority Status**

In the United States, a person's race and culture still have a big impact on how well they do in school. Even now, this is still the case. Recent polls done by the National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) show that, on average, minority students are less successful in school than their White classmates. There are many reasons why minority students don't do as well in school, but the study points to three main ones: minorities are more likely to live in low-income or single-parent households; their parents are more likely to have less education; and the schools that minorities often go to are often under-funded. All of these things affect how well a student does in school and are part of a person's socioeconomic status

# Getting to Know the Studies Several

We used both computer searches and human searches in order to whittle down the numerous research that have been conducted on the correlation between socioeconomic status (SES) and academic performance (Achievement Gap). During the computerised search, we looked through the databases of Education Resources Information Center (ERIC), Psychological Information Index (PsycINFO), and Sociological Abstracts. For the purpose of determining someone's socioeconomic standing, a wide variety of terms, including social class, income, poverty, and disadvantaged, were used (SES). People would describe how well they did in school using words like "achievement," "success," and "performance," among other similar words. Both the SES set of search terms and the academic achievement set of search terms made use of the OR operator, but the AND operator was utilised to combine the results of the two sets. Because the computerised databases did not always index the studies using one of the aforementioned search words as a keyword, the search was conducted using the "anywhere" tool rather than the "keyword" option. SES was used in several studies as a secondary or control variable. We looked through each and every one of the databases that were available to us. There were 1338 records found in the PsycINFO database, 953 records found in the ERIC database, and 426 records found in the Sociological Abstracts database. Even after removing the duplicate documents, there were still a total of 2,014 unique documents. The research on socioeconomic status

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

and educational attainment has frequently acknowledged both of these findings. This resulted in the finding of an additional 266 papers discussing Coleman's report, as well as an extra 170 pieces discussing White's study. During the initial search, I came across 27 potential leads that originated from earlier research and narrative reviews. In the end, there were a total of 2,477 unique papers that were included in the pool. Through reviewing the abstracts of each study, I was able to reduce the scope of this investigation down to 201 different papers. After reading over all of the submissions, I came to a conclusion about which articles should be included. As a direct consequence of this, I was only able to add 58 articles from peer-reviewed journals that fulfilled the requirements.

# Methodology

Despite these limitations, the findings of this meta-analysis provide researchers in the field of education with some helpful pointers. According to the findings as a whole, researchers have to continue studying at a student's socioeconomic status (SES) in order to learn more about how a student's home life can effect how well they do in school. On the other hand, deciding how to evaluate SES might be a challenging endeavour. The following information, which is based on the findings of this meta-analysis, can be useful to education scholars who are attempting to gain a better understanding of the social and economic backgrounds of pupils. To begin, it is of the utmost significance to give some thought to the unit of analysis. Because researchers may obtain data on socioeconomic status at the level of schools and/or neighbourhoods from so many different state and national datasets, they are more likely to commit the ecological fallacy. Because the amount of analysis at the student level and the level of analysis at the school or neighbourhood level are so different from one another, future study should consider how aggregate data might be used to understand how things operate at the individual level. Combining data about an individual with data about a school or about the whole is now possible, for example, thanks to the development of multilevel modelling tools. Due to the fact that it is able to assess both the impacts on the person and the effects on the school, this method can be used to combat the ecological fallacy. Second, socioeconomic status is a multifaceted notion that includes a wide range of components that each have their own unique consequences. When it comes to constructing their understanding of socioeconomic status (SES), academics typically rely on the three classic SES factors-income, education, and profession. When researchers operationalize SES, they should make an effort to use more than one part of it. If they only use one part, the results are more likely to exaggerate the effect of SES. Researchers should aim to employ more than one element. Third, using school lunch programmes as a measurement is conceptually faulty, despite the fact that it is a frequent technique to gauge socioeconomic status (SES). When determining who qualifies for the programme, there is a possibility of making an error in the selection process. It is difficult to differentiate between the influence of socioeconomic status (SES) and the impact of a school lunch programme on the academic achievement of a student. This is maybe the most essential point. In addition, studies have shown that there is a weakening correlation between eligibility for full or partial school meal programmes and academic achievement as the grade level increases. [Citation needed] One possible explanation for this phenomenon is that adolescents are less prone than younger children to complete out applications (McLoyd, 1998). In spite of these issues, eligibility for lunch programmes is still one of the socioeconomic factors that is used the most frequently in the study that is being done on academic attainment right now. This is due, in part, to the fact that it is simpler to obtain than school records and does not require information to be gathered from kids as well as their parents. According to Hauser (1994), researchers shouldn't utilise a student's eligibility for free or reduced-price lunches at school as a proxy for their socioeconomic status (SES). The findings of this analysis indicate that only a small number of research examined the ways in which students' social and economic background was affected by their neighbourhood. This is the fourth point that this review makes. The vast majority of studies conducted on socioeconomic status in neighbourhoods have made use of census tract data in order to determine how SES is organised within a community. This method isn't foolproof because it can be used to discuss a wide variety of communities, each of which has its own

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

unique qualities. Additionally, it just provides a rough marker for community SES, which isn't necessarily the most accurate way to characterise the SES of the community itself. Despite these limitations, the census tract may be able to tell us something about the relationship between socioeconomic status and academic achievement that we might not be able to learn from the variables of family socioeconomic status on their own. In addition to data from census tracts, future research should focus on developing innovative approaches for incorporating the features of neighbourhoods into the application of SES. There are other, preferable choices, such as the implementation of a variety of neighbourhood safety measures. These other methods could be more accurate ways to determine how the socioeconomic status of a family influences the general socioeconomic health of the neighbourhood in which they live and where they send their children to school. Fifth, it would appear that pupils of different races attach diverse meanings to the acronym SES. One of the most important findings of this investigation was that the correlation between socioeconomic status and academic success did not appear to be as robust for people of colour as it was for people of White ethnicity. SES is an essential component that should be looked at more for White kids, but it doesn't tell us much about the social and economic background of minorities. More research has to be done on this topic. In spite of the fact that this could be partially explained by the difference in variance between the two groups (studies with minority samples are likely to have less variance in SES variables than studies with White samples), researchers looking at SES with minority students should think about using other indicators of SES, such as home resources and accumulated wealth. showed that although the median family income of White households is fifty percent higher than that of Black households, the median wealth, which is the distribution of capital assets like home and estate ownership, is approximately ten times higher. This is despite the fact that the median family income of White households is fifty percent higher than that of Black households. Either the researchers should define SES in a way that takes into account the resources available in the family and/or the wealth that has been gained over time, or they should present their findings for various ethnic groups in a variety of formats. Sixth, it is essential to determine who is responsible for providing the SES data. According to the findings, the connections between socioeconomic status (SES) and academic ability are significantly less in research that ask students about their SES as opposed to studies that ask parents. If we make the assumption that their parents know the most about their socioeconomic status, then researchers have reason to be concerned that the information provided by kids regarding their socioeconomic status may not be accurate. In the future, researchers should make an effort to obtain information about socioeconomic status not from students but rather from their parents. Finally, the location of schools should play a significant role in studies that investigate the relationship between students' socioeconomic status (SES) and the academic success they achieve. According to the findings of this analysis, the correlations between socioeconomic status and academic success were not nearly as significant for students living in cities as they were for students living in the suburbs. Therefore, if you don't take into account where the school is located, it's likely going to be difficult to differentiate between rural, urban, and suburban schools in terms of the relationships between socioeconomic status and academic achievement.

# Conclusion

This is the second review of the research that has been done on the association between socioeconomic position and academic achievement, and this meta-analysis represents the second of those reviews. The very first one was finished being constructed twenty years ago (White, 1982). Since White's study was released, there have been a number of developments in both the research that investigate the correlation between socioeconomic status and achievement, as well as the methodology that underpins the conduct of meta-analyses. The current review makes use of these developments in research methods to provide a statistical summary of the previously published research that is empirically valid and conceptually rich. In addition, the review conducts an analytical investigation into the ways in which a number of moderating factors influence the relationship

#### ISSN- 2394-5125 VOL 07, ISSUE 19, 2020

between socioeconomic status and academic achievement. Because of the findings of this review, education researchers and policymakers will have a better understanding of how the socioeconomic status (SES) of a family influences the functioning of the educational system. This understanding will allow them to take measures to ensure that everyone has the same opportunities to learn. This metaanalysis also highlights which areas require deeper inquiry into the complex linkages between socioeconomic position and degrees of achievement. These areas are highlighted in the following sentence: No matter what the major emphasis of an investigator's investigation is, that investigator should always study a student's family background. These are the conclusions that can be drawn from the overall findings. It is not at all unusual for the introduction and discussion parts of journal publications to address socioeconomic status (SES) without actually measuring it. This is the case in spite of the fact that research on academic accomplishment reveals that taking into account the social and economic setting is a crucial component of having a complete understanding of academic achievement. No longer should researchers restrict themselves to merely focusing on the environment in their discussions. Instead, they should be measuring and analysing the social and economic environment in relation to their particular area of interest. In addition to these other, more general aspects, this meta-analysis also raises a number of methodological questions that need to be answered by the future research that is conducted in the field of education. Should we, for example, continue to use students' socioeconomic status as a primary indicator of how well they will perform in school despite the finding that there isn't much of a correlation between minority kids' socioeconomic status (SES) and their academic ability? This question arises in light of the finding that there isn't much of a correlation between minority kids' SES and their academic ability. Or, should we still force kids or the school administration to produce SES data despite the fact that it was determined that the data from parents and other sources do not agree with each other? The findings of the study can act as a springboard for further examination into the important concerns raised in this article.

# Reference

- Faaz, M. and Khan, Z.N. 2017. A Study of Academic Achievement of Upper Primary School students in Relation to their Socio-economic Status. Asian Journals of Research in Social Science and Humanities, 7(6): 121-127.
- [2]. Banerjee, A., Bardhan, P., Basu, K., Chaudhury, M. D., Ghatak, M., Guha, A. S., Majumdar, M., Mukherjee, D., Ray, D. (2002, October 12). Strategy for economic reform in West Bengal. *Economic and Political Weekly*. <u>https://www.epw.in/journal/2002/41/special-articles/strategy-economic-reform-west-bengal.html</u>
- [3]. Rather, A.S. and Sharma, K.K. 2015. Impact of Socioeconomic Status on the Academic Grades of Secondary Level Students. International Journal of Social Science & Interdisciplinary Research, 4(5): 11-15.
- [4]. Showkeen, Bilal and Rehman. Ateeiq Ul 2014. A Study of Academic Performance in Science Stream in Relation to Socio-economic Status at Senior Secondary School Level. International Journal of Recent Scientific Research, 5(1): 1 - 4.
- [5]. Chaudhury, A. B. R. (2017, July). *Narrated time constructed identities: Displaced Hindus after partition in West Bengal* (pp. 123–147). South Asia Chronicle, Humboldt University of Berlin.
- [6]. Solanke, S. and Narayanaswamy, M. 2015. Influence of Socio-economic Status on Academic Achievement of Secondary School Students of Bangalore Urban and Rural District. Journal of International Academic Research for Multidisciplinary, 3(9): 158-166.
- [7]. Akhtar, Zarina 2012. Socio-economic Status Factors Effecting the Students Achievement: A Predictive Study. International Journal of Social Science and Education, 2(1): 281-287.

- [8]. Ahluwalia, I. J., Mohanty, P. K., Mathur, O., Roy, D., Khare, A., Mangla, S. (2019, March). State of municipal finances in India: A study prepared for the fifteenth finance commission. Indian Council for Research on International Economic Relations (ICRIER).
- [9]. Bumiller, E. (1985, August 18). As Calcutta lies dying, beauty and squalor embrace. Washington Post. <u>https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/opinions/1985/08/18/as-calcutta-lies-dying-beauty-and-squalor-embrace/6be68b65-9683-4943-b078-f4f18981850d/</u>
- [10]. Chatterjee, E. (2017). Insulated wires: The precarious rise of West Bengal's power sector (Working Paper). Mapping Power Project, Centre for Policy Research and Regulatory Assistance Project.
- [11]. Firth, J., Lieu, E. (2018). Manufacturing underdevelopment: India's freight equalization scheme, and the long-run effects of distortions on the geography of production (Paper No. 316). Northeast Universities Development Consortium. http://barrett.dyson.cornell.edu/NEUDC/paper\_316.pdf
- [12]. Government of India . (2017). Annual report of the department of health and family welfare 2016–17 (Chap. 14). Medical Education Policy and Medical Education, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare